

Error Detection

Professor Dhammavihari Thero

(1) Suicide Story / Pārājikā 3	1
(2) Ājīvatṭhamaka Sīla	2
(3) Ājīvapārisuddhi Sīla treated as an item of sīla	5

(1) Suicide Story / Pārājikā 3

Tena kho pana samayena aññataro bhikkhu anabhiratīyā pīlito Gījjakūṭaṃ pabbataṃ abhirūhitvā papāte papatanto aññataraṃ vilivakāraṃ ottharivā māresi. Tassa kukkuccaṃ ahosi ... anāpatti bhikkhu pārājikassa. Na ca bhikkhave attānaṃ pātetabbaṃ. Yo pāteyya āpatti duukaṭassa ' ti. Vin. III. 82. Buddha Jayanti Tripiṭaka Pārājikā Pāli / BJT p. 180 [Identical reading]

BJT translation for *na ca bhikkhave attānaṃ pātetabbaṃ. Yo pāteyya āpatti dukkaṭassa* reads as: Mahaṇeni **ātamaghātanaya** no kaṭayutuyi. Yamek **ātmaghātanaya kere naṃ** dukuḷā avat ve. \$ 31

We consider the Sinhala translation **ātamaghātanaya** here to be a complete error. It is a serious misunderstanding of the Pali text **attānaṃ pātetabbaṃ**. The form **pātetabbaṃ** is no more than the **gerundive form** of the **causative base** of the **root pat / patati - falls** [i. e. pāteteti = causes to fall or slip off]. Hence it means no more than **cause to fall**, i.e. to jump off from.

The idea of killing in the Sinhala word **ghātanaya** of the translation can come only with the addition of the prefix **ati +** to the root / **pat** and make the verb to read **ati + pāteteti** as in **pāṇātipātā** which then means **killing of living things**.

What happened in the incident quoted here is the **'jumping off'** [*papāte*

papatanto] of the afflicted monk from the cliff. Therefore what is forbidden in the injunction is obviously the frivolous and reckless behavior of the monk, not to be repeated by any more monks, particularly in view of his falling, without knowing, upon the man who was working below.

In our opinion, this error of translation from Pali into Sinhala leads to a disastrous howler in a Vinaya judgement. This mitigates an act of suicide by a Buddhist monk. The Sinhala translation reduces this crime of self destruction or suicide to a very minor one of *dukkata*.



(2) Ājivaṭṭhamaka Sīla

1st Reference in DA.I.314 ff. Mahāli Sutta [DN.I.150-8]

Iti imesu aṭṭhasu dhammesu Bhagavatā nibbānādhigamāya paṭipannassa yogino bahūpakārattā paṭhamam sammādiṭṭhi desitā. Ayaṃ hi paññāpajjoto paññāsatthan ' ti ca vuttā. Tasmā etāya pubbabhāge vipassanā-ñāṇa-sarikhātāya sammādiṭṭhiyā avijjandhkāraṃ vidhamitvā kilesa-core ghātento khemena yogāvacaro nibbānaṃ pāpunāti. Tena vuttaṃ ' Nibbānādhigamāya paṭipannassa yogino bahukārattā paṭhamam sammādiṭṭhi desitā ' ti.

Sammā saṃkappo pana tassā bahukāro. Tasmā tadanantaraṃ vutto. Yathā hi heraññako hatthena parivattetvā parivattetvā cakkhunā kahāpaṇaṃ olokento Ayaṃ kūṭo yam cheko ' ti jānāti evaṃ yogāvacaro ' pi pubbabāge vitakkena vitakketva vitakketvā vipassanā paññāya olokayamāno ' Ime dhammā kāmāvacarā ime dhammā rūpāvacarādayo ' ti jānāti. Yathā vā pana purisena koṭiyam gahetvā parivattetvā parivattetvā dinnaṃ mahārukkhaṃ tacchako vāsiyā tacchetvā kamme upaneti evaṃ vitakkena vitakketvā dinne dhamme yogāvacaro paññāya ' Ime kāmāvacarā ime rūpāvacarā ' ti ādinā nayena paricchinditvā

kamme upaneti. Tena vuttaṃ '**sammā-saṅkappo pana tassā bahukāro tasmā tadanantaraṃ vutto**' ti.

Svāyaṃ yathā sammā-dīṭṭhiyā evaṃ sammā-vācāya 'pi upakārako. Yathāha 'Pubbe kho gahapati vitakketvā vicāretvā pacchā vācaṃ bhindatī ti **tasmā tadanantaraṃ sammā vācā vuttā**. Yasmā pana idaṅ ca idaṅ ca karissāmī 'ti paṭhamam vācāya samviditvā loke kammante payojenti **tasmā sammā-vācā kāya-kammaṣṣa upakārakā 'ti sammā-vācāya anantaraṃ sammā kammanto vutto**.

Catubbhidaṃ pana vacī-duccaritaṃ tividhaṅ ca kāya-duccaritaṃ pahāya ubhaya-sucaritaṃ pūrentass 'eva yasmā ājīva-aṭṭhamakaṃ sīlaṃ pūreti na itarassa. Tasmā tad-ubhayantaraṃ sammā ājīvo vutto

NOTE:

This discussion makes it quite clear that **ājīvaṭṭhamaka-sīla** here is a **single item of sīla** which specifically refers to **sammā ājīva** of the Eightfold Path. It does not seem to imply a bundle of *sīla* like **pañca-sīla** or **aṭṭhaṅga-uposatha-sīla**. It is given here as coming after the listing of **sammā dīṭṭhi** and **sammā saṅkappa**: **tad-ubhayantaraṃ sammā ājīvo vutto**. Those two also seems to be viewed as **sīla**.

Evaṃ visuddhājīvena pana 'Parisuddho me ājīvo 'ti ettāvataṃ paritosam katvā sutta-pamattena viharituṃ na yuttaṃ.

Atha kho '**Sabba-iriyāpathesu idaṃ viriyaṃ ārabhitabban**' ti dassetuṃ tadanantaraṃ **sammā-vāyāmo vutto**. Tato āraddha-viriyenā 'pi kāyādisu catusu vatthusu sati supaṭṭhitā kātabbā 'ti dassanatthaṃ tadanantaraṃ **sammā-sati desitā**.

Yasmā pana evaṃ supaṭṭhitā sati samādhissa upakārāpakārānaṃ dhammānaṃ gatiyo samannesitvā pahoti ekattārammaṇo cittaṃ samādhātuṃ tasmā **sammā-satiyā anantaraṃ sammā-samādhi desito** 'ti veditabbo.

Ājīvaṭṭhamaka Sīla - 1st Reference in DA.I. 314 ff. Mahāli Sutta [DN. I. 150-8]

*Iti imesu aṭṭhasu dhammesu Bhagavatā nibbānādhigamāya paṭipannassa yogino bahūpakārattā **paṭhamam sammādiṭṭhi desitā**. Ayaṃ hi paññāpajjoto paññāsathan ' ti ca vuttā. Tasmā etāya pubbabhāge **vipassanā-ñāṇa-sarikhātāya sammādiṭṭhiyā** avijjandhkāraṃ vidhamitvā kilesa-core ghātento khemena yogāvacaro nibbānaṃ pāpunāti. Tena vuttaṃ ' Nibbānādhigamāya paṭipannassa yogino bahukārattā **paṭhamam sammādiṭṭhi desitā ' ti**.*

***Sammā samkappo pana tassā bahukāro. Tasmā tadanantaram vutto.** Yathā hi heraññako hatthena parivattetvā parivattetvā cakkhunā kahāpaṇaṃ olokento Ayaṃ kūṭo yam cheko ' ti jānāti evaṃ yogāvacaro ' pi pubbabāge vitakkena vitakketva vitakketvā vipassanā paññāya olokayamāno ' Ime dhammā kāmāvacarā ime dhammā rūpāvacarādayo ' ti jānāti. Yathā vā pana purisena koṭiyam gahetvā parivattetvā parivattetvā dinnam mahārukkham tacchako vāsiyā tacchetvā kamme upaneti evaṃ vitakkena vitakketvā dinne dhamme yogāvacaro paññāya ' Ime kāmāvacarā ime rūpāvacarā ' ti ādinā nayena paricchinditvā kamme upaneti. Tena vuttaṃ **sammā-samkappo pana tassā bahukāro tasmā tadanantaram vutto ' ti**.*

*Svāyam yathā sammā-diṭṭhiyā evaṃ sammā-vācāya ' pi upakārako. Yathāha ' Pubbe kho gahapati vitakketvā vicāretvā pacchā vācaṃ bhindatī ti **tasmā tadanantaram sammā vācā vuttā**. Yasmā pana idaṅ ca idaṅ ca karissāmī ' ti paṭhamam vācāya samviditvā loke kammante payojenti **tasmā sammā-vācā kāya-kammasa upakārakā ' ti sammā-vācāya anantaram sammā kammanto vutto**.*

Catubbhidam pana vacī-duccaritam tividhañ ca kāya-duccaritam pahāya ubhaya-sucaritam pūrentass ' eva yasmā ājīva-aṭṭhamakam sīlam pūreti na itarassa. Tasmā tad-ubhayantaram sammā ājīvo vutto

NOTE:

This discussion makes it quite clear that **ājīvaṭṭhamaka-sīla** here is **a single item of sīla** which specifically refers to **sammā ājīva** of the Eightfold Path. It does

not seem to imply a bundle of *sīla* like *pañca-sīla* or *aṭṭhaṅga-uposatha-sīla*. It is given here as coming after the listing of **sammā diṭṭhi** and **sammā saṅkappa**: *tad-ubhayantaraṃ sammā ājīvo vutto*. Those two also seems to be viewed as *sīla*.

Evam visuddhājīvena pana ' Parisuddho me ājīvo ' ti ettāvataṃ paritosam katvā sutta-pamattena viharituṃ na yuttaṃ.

Atha kho 'Sabba-iriyaṃpathesu idaṃ viriyaṃ ārabhitabban ' ti dassetuṃ tadanantaraṃ sammā-vāyāmo vutto. Tato āradha-viriyaṇā ' pi kāyādisu catusu vatthusu sati supaṭṭhitā kātabbā ' ti dassanattaṃ tadanantaraṃ sammā-sati desitā.

Yasmā pana evaṃ supaṭṭhitā sati samādhissa upakārāpakārānaṃ dhammānaṃ gatiyo samannesitvā pahoti ekattārammaṇo cittaṃ samādhātuṃ tasmā sammā-satiyā anantaraṃ sammā-samādhi desito ' ti vedītabbo.

Etesaṃ dhammānaṃ sacchikiriyāyā ' ti etesaṃ sotāpatti-phalādīni pacchakkha-kiriyatthāya.



(3) Ājīvapārisuddhi Sīla treated as an item of sīla

Samaṇamaṇḍikā Sutta MN.II.27

Katame ca thapati kusalasīlā? Kusalaṃ kāyakammaṃ kusalaṃ vacīkammam. **Ājīvapārisuddhim ' pi kho ahaṃ thapati sīlasmiṃ vadāmi.** Ime vuccanti thapati kusalasīlā.

NOTE:

Here also it seems **to be no more than a single item of sīla**: *Ājīvapārisuddhim ' pi... sīlasmiṃ vadāmi.*

Ājivaṭṭhamakasīla forced into the Canonical tradition in the Commentaries under the category of *Ājivapārisuddhim*.

*Pabbajitvāna kāyena pāpakammaṃ vivajjayi
vacīduccaritaṃ hitva ājivaṃ parisodhayi* Sn. 409

See Commentary: Tividhaṃ kāyaduccaritaṃ vajjesi catubbidhaṃ vacīduccaritaṃ... micchājivaṃ hitvā sammājivameva pavattayi. Evaṃ **ājivaṭṭhamakasīlaṃ sodhetvā**. SnA. II. 382

